

MANITOBA CLEAN ENVIRONMENT COMMISSION

HOG PRODUCTION INDUSTRY REVIEW

TRANSCRIPT OF PROCEEDINGS

* * * * *

Held at the Emerson Community Complex

Emerson, Manitoba

THURSDAY, MARCH 15, 2007

* * * * *

APPEARANCES:

Clean Environment Commission:

Mr. Terry Sargeant	Chairman
Mr. Edwin Yee	Member
Mr. Wayne Motheral	Member
Ms. Joyce Mueller	Commission Secretary
Mr. Doug Smith	Report Writer

Presentations:	PAGE
Scott Lins, Farmer	944
Lyle Loewen, Farmer	958
Larry Maendel, Blue Clay Colony	972
Cliff Graydon, Farmer	981
Mike Maendel, Blue Clay Colony	994
Jack Penner, MP	995
Kurt Siemens, Farmer	1009
Archie Hunter, RM Franklin	1021

INDEX OF EXHIBITS

NO EXHIBITS MARKED

1 THURSDAY, MARCH 15, 2007

2 UPON COMMENCING AT 1:18 P.M.

3 THE CHAIRMAN: Good afternoon.

4 Welcome to, I think it's day seven, of our tour of
5 southern Manitoba. My name is Terry Sargeant.

6 I'm the Chair of the Manitoba Clean Environment
7 Commission, as well as the Chair of this panel.

8 With me on the panel are Wayne Motheral and Edwin
9 Yee.

10 I have a few comments to make by way
11 of opening notes. The Clean Environment
12 Commission has been requested by the Minister of
13 Conservation to conduct an investigation into the
14 environmental sustainability of hog production in
15 Manitoba.

16 The Terms of Reference from the
17 Minister direct us to review the current
18 environmental protection measures that are in
19 place relating to hog production, in order to
20 determine their effectiveness for the purpose of
21 managing the industry in an environmentally
22 sustainable manner.

23 Our investigation is to include a
24 public component to gain advice and feedback from
25 Manitobans.

1 We have also been asked to take into
2 account efforts underway in other jurisdictions to
3 manage hog production in a sustainable manner.

4 Further, we are to review the
5 contents of a report prepared by Manitoba
6 Conservation, entitled: "An Examination of the
7 Environmental Sustainability of the Hog Industry
8 in Manitoba."

9 At the end of our investigations, we
10 will consider options, and make recommendations,
11 to the Minister on any improvements that may be
12 necessary to provide for environmental
13 sustainability of hog production.

14 To ensure that our review includes
15 issues of importance to all Manitobans, the panel
16 has undertaken to hold 17 days of meetings in 14
17 communities throughout the agricultural part of
18 Manitoba. These meetings continue throughout
19 March and April, with the final meeting currently
20 scheduled for Winnipeg on April 27th.

21 It is open to any groups, or
22 individuals, to make a presentation to this panel
23 on issues related to our mandate. For the most
24 part, presentations are to be limited to 15
25 minutes. Exceptions may be made, in some cases,

1 where a presenter needs more time, and has
2 arranged for more time prior to the presentation.

3 We will ask that all presenters take
4 an oath promising to tell the truth.

5 Presentations must be relevant to the mandate
6 given to us by the Minister. If a presentation is
7 clearly not relevant, it may be ruled out of
8 order. And if it is clearly repetitive, it may
9 also be ruled out of order.

10 Members of the panel may ask questions
11 of any presenter, during or after the
12 presentation. There will be no opportunity for
13 others to ask questions or cross-examine
14 presenters.

15 In addition to the public meetings,
16 the Clean Environment Commission has engaged
17 consultants to assist us in this review. The
18 results of those research endeavours undertaken by
19 those consultants will be posted on our website,
20 upon receipt, which, for the most part, will be in
21 late June. Interested parties, which means really
22 anybody who wishes, will be invited to provide
23 comment on any of those reports. A reasonable,
24 but brief period of time, will be allowed for
25 this.

1 Written submissions will also be
2 accepted. Information as to how to submit written
3 submissions is available on our website. The
4 deadline for written submissions is May 7th.

5 We also realize that many people are
6 reluctant to make a presentation in public, for a
7 variety of reasons. To address that, we have
8 engaged a person from the university to meet with,
9 or talk on the phone with, persons who would
10 rather not speak at the meetings. These meetings
11 will be kept in confidence. Information as to how
12 to contact this person is available on our
13 website, as well as at the table at the back of
14 the room.

15 If you wish to make a presentation
16 today, and have not already registered, please do
17 so at the table at the back of the room.

18 As is our normal practice, we are
19 recording these sessions. Transcripts will be
20 available online in a day or so. You can find the
21 link from our website.

22 And, finally, I would ask that in
23 respect of cell phones, please turn the phones
24 off, or at least the ring tone off. If you must
25 take a call, please leave the room. And, also, do

1 not engage in any conversations in the audience
2 while people are making presentations.

3 We have, I believe, three people,
4 three or four people, who have indicated they wish
5 to make presentations this afternoon. Three of
6 them are here now. And one of them we expect at
7 about three o'clock. I would call first on Scott
8 Lins. Would you please state your name for the
9 record?

10 MR. LINS: My name is Scott Lins.

11 SCOTT LINS, having been sworn, presents as
12 follows:

13 THE CHAIRMAN: Thank you. You may
14 proceed.

15 MR. LINS: Yes, again, for the record,
16 my name is Scott Lins. And I would like to thank
17 the Commission for the opportunity to be able to
18 speak here today.

19 I've been to a number of these
20 meetings, and I have heard a lot of talk about the
21 nameless and faceless corporations that are being
22 referred to by many of the presenters. And I am
23 here today to be able to put a name and a face to
24 that. I have worked in this industry for about 14
25 years. And 100 percent of my household income

1 comes from raising hogs.

2 And I started working in the barns
3 when I came into this industry. And over the
4 years, I have been given opportunities to do many
5 things that I would not normally have been able to
6 do.

7 I feel fortunate to work in an
8 industry that provides two great products: Pork
9 to feed people, and natural fertilizer, in the
10 form of hog manure, to grow crops. And I am here
11 today feeling that I have to defend my industry
12 and my company. And I find it a bit disappointing
13 to be in that position.

14 Over my career, I have worked with
15 many people who grew grain to feed hogs, and used
16 the manure to fertilize fields in order to grow
17 grain to feed more hogs. And these were people
18 who understood what sustainable agriculture was
19 all about. And this still is the model that is
20 used today. People have been doing this for
21 years. And it is a model that works and can
22 continue to be sustainable for everyone, large or
23 small.

24 I have often heard criticisms about
25 these so-called mega barns that are in our

1 presence today. And I hope that people truly
2 understand why these barns have come into being.
3 They have been built to lower the influence of
4 micro-organisms on the foods that we eat. They
5 were built to maintain good environmental control
6 for the animals and not have them subjected to the
7 external elements. And, ultimately, they were
8 built to help create a safer product for our
9 consumers today.

10 And you know what, yes, they were
11 actually built to make money. And I don't believe
12 that there is a need to apologize for that. If we
13 didn't make a profit, I wouldn't be here today. I
14 wouldn't have a job within this industry.

15 Over the years, I have had the honour
16 of serving on industry committees that have looked
17 at providing solutions that have arisen within our
18 industry. I have dealt with issues ranging from
19 unjustified trade actions to developing new
20 environmental regulations. We have one of the
21 most proactive industries in Manitoba. We are
22 doing things now that we are -- if we are doing
23 things now that require improvement, this industry
24 has shown its commitment to change for the better.

25 I live in this province. My family

1 recreates on the land and in the waterways. And I
2 am not looking, as part of an industry, to create
3 challenges. I want to be part of the solutions
4 that we bring forward, economically and socially.
5 But first we need to understand, you know, what
6 the challenges are within this province, and who
7 the players are that are involved, so that we do
8 not start down the path of some type of witch
9 hunt.

10 I find it unfortunate that people can
11 make outrageous claims, without ever having any
12 real evidence to back up what they are saying.
13 Attacking the swine industry is an example of good
14 politics, but very bad public policy.

15 In summary, I have witnessed a lot of
16 changes over my time within the swine industry,
17 changes that have moved the industry towards more
18 progressive ideas and more progressive thinking.
19 My challenge to the committee members today is to
20 come out to see how the industry works. Come out
21 and see what processes are in place. Come visit
22 the barns and understand what goes on at that
23 level. Come and see the manure being applied to
24 the fields that grow crops, to be able to
25 understand how that works.

1 And to review the pertinent research
2 and the science behind the industry. And then I
3 hope, after you've done that, then you can come
4 forward and be able to make the recommendations,
5 after all of the relevant information has been
6 collected. Certainly, this industry has nothing
7 to hide. And after you've done that work, you
8 will realize what a positive impact this industry
9 has on this province. And that is all I have to
10 say.

11 THE CHAIRMAN: Thank you very much,
12 Mr. Lins. I can tell you that we fully intend to
13 take some of your last bits of advice. We haven't
14 yet visited barns, but we have talked with some
15 operators about doing that. And that will
16 probably happen in May, after we're finished this
17 crazy round of meetings all over the province.

18 We are engaged in reviewing a lot of
19 the research. Well, we have engaged people from
20 the University of Manitoba to review the research
21 for us and provide us with reports on that. So we
22 are doing some of the things that you have
23 suggested. And I do hope that, at the end of the
24 day, we will have collected all of the relevant
25 information, which will help guide any

1 recommendations that we do have make to the
2 Minister.

3 Could you tell me, or tell us, a
4 little bit about your operations or who you work
5 for?

6 MR. LINS: Yes. I work for the
7 Puratone Corporation.

8 THE CHAIRMAN: Well, that's one of the
9 companies I have talked to senior people about
10 visiting at least one of your operations. I have
11 talked to both Ab Frieg.

12 MR. LINS: Correct.

13 THE CHAIRMAN: And it has slipped my
14 mind, another gentleman who was in Arborg last
15 week.

16 MR. LINS: Darcy Pauls.

17 THE CHAIRMAN: Yes. And Puratone has
18 a number of barns around the province, do they
19 not?

20 MR. LINS: Yes, sir.

21 THE CHAIRMAN: And other barns or
22 operations. You have barns sort of at all three
23 stages, would that be a fair assumption?

24 MR. LINS: That is correct.

25 THE CHAIRMAN: How many hogs, in

1 total, would go through Puratone's operations in a
2 year?

3 MR. LINS: In terms of to market?

4 THE CHAIRMAN: Yes.

5 MR. LINS: There would be,
6 approximately, between 400,000 and 450,000.

7 THE CHAIRMAN: And that would be fully
8 grown hogs?

9 MR. LINS: That is correct.

10 THE CHAIRMAN: That go to process.
11 And do you sell off weanlings to other grow
12 operations?

13 MR. LINS: Yes, we do. We also feed
14 animals in the U.S. and grow animals out there.
15 And that was done, I think, fortunately, for more
16 of an economic point of view. And, as well, we do
17 also sell isoweans and feeder pigs into --
18 primarily into the U.S. market.

19 THE CHAIRMAN: Thank you. Wayne?

20 MR. MOTHERAL: Just one question,
21 Mr. Lins. We -- in fact, I have a hog operation
22 down -- I'm a farmer, by the way. I am not
23 farming in hogs. But I do have neighbours who
24 have hog operations. And they do ship a lot of
25 their weanlings to the States. Now, is that a

1 two-way process? Are there things from the States
2 that come up here? You know, are there little
3 weanlings that come up here, or is it just a
4 one-way deal?

5 MR. LINS: It is really just a one-way
6 deal.

7 MR. MOTHERAL: It is. For most of
8 your operations, of course, you have to abide by
9 certain regulations that are out there. Do all of
10 your operations have straw covered or synthetic
11 covers on the lagoons, et cetera? Do you abide by
12 all of those regulations?

13 MR. LINS: Do we abide by the
14 regulations? We absolutely abide by the
15 regulations.

16 MR. MOTHERAL: Yes. But I am just
17 asking --

18 MR. LINS: Oh, okay. But do we all
19 have straw covers? No, they do not all have straw
20 covers.

21 MR. MOTHERAL: Yes.

22 MR. LINS: And, you know, it will
23 really come down to how close our neighbours are,
24 and what concerns that our neighbours have had in
25 the past with any, you know, issues in terms of

1 odour.

2 MR. MOTHERAL: In any of your
3 operations, have you had any concern from
4 neighbours?

5 MR. LINS: Yes, sir. Yes, we
6 absolutely have.

7 MR. MOTHERAL: And have they been
8 overwhelming, or are they just kind of, you feel,
9 normal concerns?

10 MR. LINS: Well, they certainly
11 haven't been overwhelming. You know, I would say
12 that we've maybe had, over the last five years
13 now -- I am kind of going back to, you know, just
14 speaking for myself in terms of my position at the
15 company. But I have personally dealt with, over
16 that period of time, one issue.

17 MR. MOTHERAL: Okay. And are most of
18 your operations centered in and around
19 southeastern Manitoba?

20 MR. LINS: They are, actually, spread
21 out. And Puratone has three feed mills. They
22 have one in Niverville, one in Arborg and one in
23 Winkler. And a lot of the operations tend to be
24 surrounding or, you know, within those areas in
25 Manitoba.

1 MR. MOTHERAL: Yes, in that area.

2 MR. LINS: And that's not to say that
3 they are not also spread out over the province a
4 little bit more, but they tend to be aggregated
5 around there.

6 MR. MOTHERAL: In any of your
7 operations, did you have to go through any
8 conditional use hearings at all?

9 MR. LINS: Yes, sir, we have.

10 MR. MOTHERAL: Okay. I will think of
11 more questions in a minute, if you want to pass
12 over to Edwin. Because Edwin accused me the other
13 day of taking all of his questions.

14 MR. YEE: That's fine, Wayne, believe
15 me. Mr. Lins, I just have a few questions. What
16 is your position at Puratone?

17 MR. LINS: Right now I am the business
18 analyst at Puratone, but that has changed within
19 the last few months. Prior to that, I was the
20 operations manager for the swine division.

21 MR. YEE: And Puratone, do they own
22 all of the barns, or do you contract out to other
23 operations for production?

24 MR. LINS: There are a lot of
25 arrangements. We do own a large part of our

1 operation. Obviously, we own the building and the
2 stock.

3 But we also have arrangements, by
4 which the farmer will own the building and then we
5 own the stock. And then we also have
6 arrangements, by which, you know, the farmer will
7 own the building. They will own the stock. And
8 then we will provide management solutions for
9 them, as well.

10 MR. YEE: So there is, more or less, a
11 wide range of situations in terms of hog
12 production under Puratone?

13 MR. LINS: Yes, there are.

14 MR. YEE: Thank you.

15 THE CHAIRMAN: How much of your
16 operation is in the United States?

17 MR. LINS: In terms of percentage, it
18 would probably be roughly 15 to 20 percent.

19 THE CHAIRMAN: And is that mainly sort
20 of finishing grow operations?

21 MR. LINS: That is correct.

22 THE CHAIRMAN: So, for the most part,
23 if not all, the weanlings would come from
24 Manitoba?

25 MR. LINS: Sorry, say that again?

1 THE CHAIRMAN: For the most part,
2 would most or all of the weanlings, the young
3 hogs, come from Manitoba?

4 MR. LINS: That is right, they are all
5 grown here.

6 THE CHAIRMAN: Okay, thank you.

7 MR. LINS: You are welcome.

8 MR. MOTHERAL: Just one more. Did
9 your corporation have any plans for future
10 expansion before the moratorium?

11 MR. LINS: The only real plans, it has
12 been detailed at our executive level, that
13 expansion for the foreseeable future will be done
14 through more purchasing of existing operations.
15 And, you know, that has sort of been our corporate
16 mandate over the last couple of years. There
17 hasn't really been any -- well, we haven't done
18 any new construction projects in quite a number of
19 years.

20 The only potential changes that we
21 were going to see, probably within the next couple
22 of years, were perhaps just some additions or
23 some, you know, retro changes within the
24 operations. But there has not been any major
25 plans to do anything different.

1 THE CHAIRMAN: This is a supposition.
2 If you can't answer it, that's fair enough. If
3 the Olywest Plant had or does go ahead, would that
4 change any of your operations? Would you finish
5 more in Manitoba to sell -- potentially sell to
6 that operation?

7 MR. LINS: Well, certainly the Olywest
8 project does offer opportunities for everybody
9 within the industry, there is no question about
10 that. And would it change the dynamics? You
11 know, being a commodity-based business, and being
12 influenced by many, many external factors, it is
13 really hard to say. And I am not trying to avoid
14 the question. I am just trying to be very honest.
15 But certainly something like that would provide
16 opportunity for, you know, a different business
17 model, absolutely.

18 THE CHAIRMAN: This is another
19 question that if you can't answer it, that's fair.
20 Is there a limit to the amount of hogs that can be
21 produced in Manitoba?

22 MR. LINS: Well, you know, there
23 certainly would be. I mean, you know, we've
24 got -- you know, we have got a lot of arable
25 lands. But, you know, there is a potential limit.

1 Are we at that limit? I wouldn't think that we
2 are even close to that limit, at this point, in
3 terms of what the productive capabilities are of
4 the land, and what opportunities there are, both
5 on the hog side, and both for changing over from
6 synthetic fertilizers to a more natural
7 fertilizer.

8 THE CHAIRMAN: I imagine that the
9 market could or would place limits on the
10 potential amount of hog production in the
11 province?

12 MR. LINS: Yes, absolutely. Yes,
13 without question.

14 THE CHAIRMAN: Did you have another
15 one?

16 MR. MOTHERAL: Yes, I have one more
17 here. In any of your operations, would you
18 require to have more spread field acres because of
19 the new phosphorus regulations?

20 MR. LINS: Most of our operations, and
21 I say most, you know, I'm thinking anywhere from
22 85 to 90 percent, will not be affected by those
23 phosphorus regulations. The ones that will be,
24 will require a slight change in field rotation,
25 and can be dealt with based on that. So in terms

1 of those new regulations, you know, at Puratone,
2 we don't see a significant altering of what we're
3 doing at present.

4 MR. YEE: No questions.

5 THE CHAIRMAN: Thank you very much,
6 Mr. Lins.

7 MR. LINS: You are welcome. Thank
8 you.

9 THE CHAIRMAN: Next is Mr. Lyle
10 Loewen.

11 MR. LOEWEN: Loewen, dropped the
12 German.

13 THE CHAIRMAN: You never know. Some
14 do, some don't. Would you please introduce
15 yourself for the record?

16 MR. LOEWEN: My name is Lyle Loewen.
17 LYLE LOEWEN, having been sworn, presents as
18 follows:

19 THE CHAIRMAN: Thank you. Please go
20 ahead.

21 MR. LOEWEN: Okay. As I stated
22 earlier, my name is Lyle Loewen. I would like to
23 thank the Commission for the job that they are
24 doing. I think it is an important part of
25 government, setting government policy.

1 I want to speak today -- I am also
2 with the Puratone Corporation. Right now I'm the
3 director of swine production within Puratone.
4 But, really, today I am also just a -- I own a
5 farm, as well, up in the Interlake. I, actually,
6 would have liked to been up in Arborg speaking,
7 because Arborg is my hometown, but I was out of
8 the country, so I couldn't. So I am here in
9 Emerson today.

10 So I really want to speak probably
11 more as a sole proprietor of a farm. And
12 certainly if you have questions pertaining to
13 Puratone, I can try to answer those as well. I
14 have sort of broken it down to three areas, sort
15 of the history where our family comes from, sort
16 of the farming sustainability, and just a few
17 comments on the future, is how I want to approach
18 this day.

19 So we are third generation farmers.
20 Actually, probably more than three generations.
21 Three generations in Manitoba. Our family, we
22 grew up between the lakes, so between Lake
23 Manitoba and Lake Winnipeg, in Arborg and in the
24 Washow Bay regions. We, actually, moved to that
25 area because the government encouraged my parents,

1 that group, that generation, to move there,
2 because they wanted to agriculture going in that
3 area in the Washow Bay. So they gave land away,
4 which my parents, my father and my uncle, were
5 happy to take. And so they moved up there, and
6 they began farming and breaking up the land and
7 trying to grow crops.

8 Of course, in those days, you didn't
9 just have grain, or you didn't just have pigs, it
10 was mixed farming. And there begins, sort of, the
11 balance between, you know, the manure. And
12 especially up in the land up north, you needed to
13 enhance the land so that you could grow some
14 decent crops to feed your pigs, to have a decent
15 cash flow, so that you could have a living. And
16 that's sort of the basis where our family farming
17 started.

18 We also, just as a comment, grew up on
19 the lakes. We boated and we water-skied. And
20 that was our family recreation. We windsurfed.
21 All of our swimming lessons -- we never had a
22 swimming lessons ever. It was always on Lake
23 Winnipeg. If it was too wavy and windy, we had to
24 find something else to do that day. And because
25 of that, we sort of have an appreciation of the

1 waterways and the lakes. And we want to take care
2 of all that because we want to enjoy it in the
3 years to come.

4 The old way of farming was mixed
5 farming. You know, we had the hogs, cattle,
6 chickens, turkeys. And back in those days, the
7 farm was able to sustain two families; the uncle,
8 as well as our family. But, really, for economic
9 reasons, we had to start specializing. We had to
10 start growing just to be able to sustain. We got,
11 you know, into a feed milling business as well.
12 And we had to find ways to etch a living, you
13 know, out of the ground and out of the livestock,
14 so to speak.

15 So in order to be sustainable, we had
16 to expand. And in order to expand, then you had
17 to find ways to handle, you know, the manure from
18 your livestock. And, of course, we did that with
19 our neighbours together. We utilized their land,
20 as well as our own.

21 Of course, throughout all of our
22 expansion, we have been able to maintain that
23 balance of livestock to land usage. And I've
24 always been in favour of the manure regulations
25 because it, actually, brought some science to what

1 our family had been doing for a long time.

2 So when the regulations came in, you
3 know, at first you sort of groan about it. But as
4 you start getting into, you know, planning and how
5 much you are going to apply, and you start testing
6 your soil, you actually realize that, you know,
7 this is actually a good thing that's happening. I
8 have actually learned to appreciate that from a
9 farming standpoint. And, you know, it gives us a
10 sense of security and safety knowing that we are
11 doing it right.

12 You know, as we specialized, we were
13 able to become more knowledgeable and have more
14 resources to put, as well, towards manure
15 management. I would think in the old days, you
16 know, when I was just young growing up on the
17 farm, well, I think our manure -- I mean, it just
18 went out the back door. Later on in the summer,
19 you would haul it out to the garden in the
20 wheelbarrow or haul it out. But certainly
21 nowadays, you know, we are able to put more
22 resources just on ours. We have a 900 sow farm.
23 And we are able to put resources on there that we
24 were never able to put on it before in how we
25 handle the manure and do it properly.

1 And as to the future, you know, my
2 goal as a farmer in this province would be that,
3 you know, my son and his son, and his son after
4 that, can continue to be hog farmers in the
5 province, because it's been very good for myself.
6 It's been very good for my father and his father
7 before him.

8 And science definitely needs to be the
9 driver in the decisions based around the
10 sustainability of farming, and particularly the
11 hog industry. And I applaud the Commission, as I
12 heard some discussion with Scott earlier, you
13 know, that, you know, you are employing the
14 University of Manitoba and some consulting. And
15 certainly you need to make the decisions based on
16 the science of what's going on, because that needs
17 to be the driver going ahead.

18 Sustainability in farming will only
19 happen if we can be competitive, and that means
20 the advancements in protocols, equipment,
21 resources, as well as efficient sizing of farming
22 operations. As you can see, from where we started
23 to where we -- if we were where we started, where
24 my dad started, we wouldn't be farming today. We
25 had to find ways to become more efficient to be

1 able to make a living out of it.

2 I just had a thought, and I will just
3 put out here, our Premier has been on many trade
4 missions. Just last week, I was in Thailand
5 myself, you know, doing some work out there. We
6 go out on these trade missions because we want to
7 promote Manitoba, and we want to sell our
8 products. But no one is going to buy our products
9 if we can't be efficient, if we can't be
10 competitive and price efficient. And, certainly,
11 that's what drives the larger farms, you know.
12 And the larger farms, as I stated earlier, are the
13 ones that are actually, probably, the most
14 responsible, I would think more so, because -- at
15 least, I go on my experience because now I have
16 the resources to put into being responsible.

17 So I would say, you know, let's put
18 the right regulations in place. And farming is
19 core, you know, to our province, the economics of
20 our province and, as well, to our way of life.
21 Thank you.

22 THE CHAIRMAN: Thank you, Mr. Loewen.
23 Now, you said that you have your own farm near
24 Arborg?

25 MR. LOEWEN: Right.

1 THE CHAIRMAN: And do you have an
2 arrangement with Puratone Corporation in respect
3 of that farm?

4 MR. LOEWEN: Yeah. Well, we built the
5 farm in 1989. And that was when we first -- it
6 was a 200 sow operation, is it was back then. And
7 right from the start, we have had a contractual
8 arrangements with them. And those are still in
9 place.

10 THE CHAIRMAN: Okay, thank you.

11 MR. LOEWEN: And we own everything.
12 They will just take our weanlings.

13 THE CHAIRMAN: They buy your product?

14 MR. LOEWEN: Yes.

15 THE CHAIRMAN: Wayne?

16 MR. MOTHERAL: I don't really have any
17 questions, but I have got a couple of comments.
18 And as I listened to your roots, and, of course, I
19 love it when I hear farming roots, and I heard
20 about your recreation in the lakes. Well, a part
21 of my recreation as a kid was tobogganing behind
22 the manure boat. I don't know why they ever
23 called it a boat, but that was what we hauled the
24 manure out in the fields with, and so my mind gets
25 wandering sometimes. But it is excellent to hear

1 it from your perspective as, more or less, a
2 professional with the hog industry, and also at
3 the local level, at the farming level. And so
4 thank you for the presentation. I've got no
5 questions.

6 MR. LOEWEN: You are welcome.

7 THE CHAIRMAN: I can't claim any
8 farming roots, but I did do much of the same
9 recreation in the same lake, growing up in Gimli,
10 except for windsurfing, which hadn't been invented
11 way back then.

12 MR. LOEWEN: It is, actually, not as
13 good as it is cracked up to be.

14 THE CHAIRMAN: Edwin?

15 MR. YEE: Yes. Mr. Loewen, I have
16 just a few questions. One of your comments was
17 that the economics of farming has changed. You
18 need to specialize to survive. Can I just get you
19 to expand on that? We have heard from other
20 presenters. And, you know, both sides of the
21 argument, you know, the corporate farm versus the
22 family farm. And I've heard from some of the
23 producers, they are essentially saying family
24 farms are corporate farms these days, because of
25 the need for the economy of scale, I guess. So

1 can you just maybe, in your own words, describe
2 what you feel is the economics of farming today
3 and the need for specialization?

4 MR. LOEWEN: Yes. I certainly
5 wouldn't make a distinction, either between family
6 farms and corporate farms. Our farm, and even my
7 father's farm, was also incorporated. I mean,
8 that was just a way of doing business. And if you
9 want to get to the legal terms, it's
10 incorporation. But, I mean, farming is a
11 business, and more and more so than it ever was in
12 the past. And I thought about the specializing
13 comment when I put it in there.

14 There are some farms that do very well
15 that are more diverse. You know, there is hog --
16 or many a grain farmer that has invested in a hog
17 farm, you know, because it adds value to what they
18 are doing. And so, I mean, that is still
19 specialization, I would think, is how I view it.
20 And they are trying to -- they are using two
21 avenues, but it is still a specialization to what
22 they are trying to do.

23 I think that we -- as the need to --
24 as the margins shrink, which happens because now
25 it is a global market, I was just back from

1 Thailand. And we were looking at Canadian hogs,
2 you know, in Thailand, and it was a neat thing to
3 see. But, I mean, what are the margins that these
4 companies are working on? And it's tough. So the
5 margins are what drives it.

6 And there is no way, as a single
7 operator in today's market, that you can have your
8 eyes -- you can be juggling three or four
9 different balls, you know. The only way you can
10 do it is if you hire somebody, and then you are no
11 longer a small farm. All of a sudden you are a
12 big corporation, so you need to specialize. And
13 that's how I view it. It's more how much energy
14 do I have, and how much time resource do I have to
15 apply to a certain business? Because I've got to
16 compete globally now on that marketplace.

17 You know, Maple Leaf, you know, they
18 are a great purchaser of our product, but they are
19 not going to give you any more just because you
20 are a small, happy farmer out there. They are
21 going to pay the same thing that they pay the
22 Puratone Corporation, or Elite Swine, or whoever
23 it happens to be.

24 So those are just some of my comments.

25 MR. YEE: No, thank you, I really

1 appreciate that.

2 THE CHAIRMAN: On your own farm, what
3 else do you do besides sows?

4 MR. LOEWEN: We, actually, used to
5 have turkeys. We, actually, had quite a large
6 turkey quota in the past. We got out of that, I
7 don't know, seven or eight years ago, probably. I
8 got sick of raising turkeys.

9 THE CHAIRMAN: Do you have grain?

10 MR. LOEWEN: No. We have pasture
11 land. Which is, actually, where we spread most of
12 our manure is on our pasture land, just to sustain
13 that for the cattle. And we just lease it out.
14 We don't have our own cattle.

15 THE CHAIRMAN: And how do you do both
16 jobs? You must be busy.

17 MR. LOEWEN: Oh, the farm and
18 Puratone?

19 THE CHAIRMAN: And Puratone?

20 MR. LOEWEN: No. Actually, that's
21 right. I just started in June. I just became the
22 swine director in June for Puratone. Actually,
23 before that I coached hockey is what I did for a
24 living. And it has, actually, been about four
25 years since I have actually been hands-on on the

1 farm.

2 THE CHAIRMAN: Who did you coach?

3 MR. LOEWEN: I coached the Selkirk
4 Steelers.

5 THE CHAIRMAN: Oh, yeah. I guess your
6 comments about just coming back from Thailand sort
7 of underlines how farming has changed in the last
8 couple of generations. Because I am sure, two or
9 three years ago, a big trip would have been to
10 Winnipeg or Brandon. Now you go to Thailand to
11 market your product.

12 MR. LOEWEN: Yes. And the most
13 interesting about the Thailand trip is we were
14 fortunate to get on to a 13,000 sow, farrow to
15 finish, operation and, you know, that was quite
16 something to see.

17 THE CHAIRMAN: In Thailand?

18 MR. LOEWEN: In Thailand. You sort of
19 think of Thailand -- before I went there, I
20 blocked it in with China and Thailand, and all of
21 these different countries. Certainly, you think,
22 well, there is two or three pigs on each farm.
23 And then when there was 13,000 sows, farrow to
24 finish, it was different than what I expected.

25 Talking about efficiencies and

1 sustainability, one thing on that farm is their
2 manure handling and the recycling of their water.
3 I mean, they just had -- and their biogas. Their
4 whole farm is run off the methane gas. Six days
5 of the week they could run off their own methane
6 gas to power the farm. And they put tremendous
7 amounts of capital into that system, and they had
8 a great system. But part of the reason was
9 because, you know, they were at the size. They
10 had enough manure there that they could actually
11 put enough resources into it to make it a real
12 good system.

13 Do you have a question?

14 MR. MOTHERAL: No, not to do with
15 that. I can talk to him afterwards.

16 THE CHAIRMAN: Thank you very much,
17 Mr. Loewen.

18 MR. LOEWEN: You are welcome.

19 THE CHAIRMAN: Next is Larry Maendel.
20 Please state your name for the record?

21 MR. MAENDEL: Larry Maendel.

22 LARRY MAENDEL, having been sworn, presents as
23 follows:

24 THE CHAIRMAN: Thank you. Please go
25 ahead.

1 MR. MAENDEL: I live on the Blue Clay
2 Hutterite Colony. I manage our hog operation and
3 our feed mill.

4 I appreciate the opportunity to
5 represent my community and myself here today.

6 We are proud of our farming and
7 agriculture background. We live off the land. We
8 are not just here for a short period of time, only
9 to move on to live in some city. We are not only
10 here for ourselves, but for our children, and many
11 more generations to come. What we do today, and
12 how we operate today, will be our children's
13 future.

14 We are not investors. We are a family
15 farm, and stewards of the land. Regulations are
16 not new to us, and we do not dispute them. We
17 follow very strict and strategic guidelines. Our
18 hog operation is validated under the Canadian
19 Quality Assurance program, and has been since its
20 introduction to Canadian hog producers.

21 Our feed processing plant is a
22 state-of-the-art facility, and is subject to
23 Canadian Food Inspection Agency inspections and
24 calibrations. Industry professionals formulate
25 our feed rations. Feed efficiency is a key factor

1 to a hog operation's success.

2 Products are available on the market
3 that will reduce synthetic phosphorus and calcium
4 levels in the feed between 35 percent and
5 45 percent, making the natural phosphorus and
6 calcium in the grains used more manageable for the
7 animal's digestive system. Note that this is an
8 added expense to the hog producer, pressuring
9 their already very lean profit margins. But this,
10 again, shows and demonstrates our willingness and
11 participation in preserving our land for future
12 generations.

13 We embrace technology. We need rules
14 and regulations.

15 We live by the rules put in place, but
16 these same rules make it nearly impossible for us
17 to make a living, and to grow future Hutterite
18 colonies, where our young people will live.

19 As farmers and hog producers, we work
20 hard to produce safe, quality pork for our
21 customers, in an environmentally sustainable way.
22 We take responsibility for taking care of our air,
23 soil, natural plants, wildlife and water
24 resources.

25 Hog manure is not a waste, but a very

1 valuable asset to our farm, decreasing fertilizer
2 and crop input costs. It is a natural fertilizer.
3 Crop land consistently produces considerably
4 higher yields when fertilized with a natural
5 fertilizer. And combining higher yields with
6 lower input costs makes a farm efficient and
7 profitable. In my opinion, synthetic fertilizers
8 and chemicals damage our soils and deplete our
9 water quality, not hog manure, when used with
10 common sense.

11 What would anyone prefer? The use of
12 chemical fertilizer or natural hog fertilizer, in
13 the form of liquid manure, injected into the soils
14 to feed our crops?

15 Talking about the current concern over
16 the environment and manure management, we inject
17 our manure into the soil with the latest,
18 state-of-the-art machinery.

19 We do this according to the
20 appropriate soil tests. We have appropriate
21 manure storage that makes sure nothing will ever
22 leak into the groundwater.

23 This natural fertilizer nourishes the
24 seeds that we plant, and the grain that grows
25 eventually feeds our hogs. This process results

1 in the highest quality pork, right from the land
2 to the table.

3 I ask anybody in this room today,
4 where and what would Manitoba be without our
5 agricultural sector? In my opinion, we would be
6 nowhere and have nothing. Where and how would our
7 sick, our elderly, our children's schools, our
8 hospitals, the list goes on and on, survive
9 without the farming community's tax revenues?
10 Certainly not from our politicians: They cost
11 money, they don't generate it.

12 We want to remain a family farm in
13 rural Manitoba. We are a valuable part of the
14 agricultural industry in this province, and we
15 want to stay that way.

16 Let us show you what we do on Blue
17 Clay Colony. I would like to invite each member
18 of the Clean Environment Commission panel to come
19 out to our farm for a mill and farm tour. Come
20 and see what a family farm is all about.

21 Thanks for your time.

22 THE CHAIRMAN: Thank you very much,
23 Mr. Maendel. I can't promise you that we will
24 come and tour your operation, but we have
25 expressed an interest, and talked with one or two

1 other Hutterite colonies, about going and visiting
2 them. So we may come to yours. We may come to
3 one of the others. But we certainly do intend to
4 look at different kinds of operations. Where is
5 Blue Clay?

6 MR. MAENDEL: Arnaud, Manitoba.

7 THE CHAIRMAN: Sorry?

8 MR. MAENDEL: Arnaud, Manitoba.

9 THE CHAIRMAN: And how big is your hog
10 operation?

11 MR. MAENDEL: 550 sows.

12 THE CHAIRMAN: And what else do you
13 do, in the way of agriculture, on your colony?

14 MR. MAENDEL: We farm 6,000 acres.

15 THE CHAIRMAN: 56,000?

16 MR. MAENDEL: 6,000.

17 THE CHAIRMAN: Oh, sorry.

18 MR. MAENDEL: We don't own the
19 province.

20 THE CHAIRMAN: And your feed mill, is
21 that for your own use, or do you sell to other
22 operations?

23 MR. MAENDEL: Just for our own use.

24 THE CHAIRMAN: Thank you. Wayne?

25 MR. MOTHERAL: Thank you, Mr. Maendel.

1 I just noticed in one of your statements here, and
2 I re-read it again, and it says, in my opinion, so
3 anybody is entitled to their opinion. But you did
4 make a statement saying that synthetic fertilizers
5 and chemicals damage our soils and deplete our
6 water quality. And I am sure that there are a lot
7 of farmers out there that would question it.
8 Everything has phosphorus and everything has
9 nitrogen. But you said it was your opinion, and
10 you're entitled to it.

11 Now, in your operation, with all of
12 the regulations that you have to abide by, do you
13 cover your lagoons? Do you have a clay lagoon or
14 a lagoon in your area?

15 MR. MAENDEL: No, we don't. We have a
16 slurry store system.

17 MR. MOTHERAL: A what?

18 MR. MAENDEL: It's a big tank. It's
19 an above-ground tank.

20 MR. MOTHERAL: You are above ground?

21 MR. MAENDEL: Yes.

22 MR. MOTHERAL: At that time, was that
23 a condition of your municipality?

24 MR. MAENDEL: Not really. It was our
25 choice.

1 MR. MOTHERAL: It was your choice.

2 Good, okay. You would be beyond the 300 animal
3 units, probably, so you do have to register a
4 Manure Management Plan?

5 MR. MAENDEL: Yes.

6 MR. MOTHERAL: Do you find that
7 onerous or do you find that a valuable tool?

8 MR. MAENDEL: Manure, yes.

9 MR. MOTHERAL: But, I mean, the whole
10 management of it, do you think it's an asset to
11 the colony in the long run, testing your soils, et
12 cetera?

13 MR. MAENDEL: Yes. It has made us
14 more efficient and made us apply it and spread out
15 over more acres.

16 MR. MOTHERAL: We are finding that
17 over the Province, at the meetings so far, that
18 some of these regulations have been good. And we
19 just had the one gentlemen before that saying that
20 it actually helped their operation, too. Thank
21 you, that's fine.

22 MR. YEE: Yes. Mr. Maendel, first of
23 all, just a point for clarification. You
24 mentioned that you had a feed mill and you have a
25 professional formulate the feed. I imagine you

1 are using enzymes for phosphate, better uses of
2 phosphate?

3 MR. MAENDEL: Yes, we do.

4 MR. YEE: I just wanted to clarify
5 that. One of the statements that you did make,
6 though, is you stated here that:

7 "The rules make it nearly impossible
8 for us to make a living to grow for
9 future Hutterite colonies."

10 Are you referring to, say, the new phosphate
11 regulations, is that what you are referring to
12 here?

13 MR. MAENDEL: It's about the whole
14 moratorium. That's one of the first things we do
15 when we start up a colony is a hog -- set up a hog
16 operation. We are good at it, and that's what we
17 want.

18 MR. YEE: But you're stating here that
19 it is regulation that is making it impossible. So
20 is it the regulations or is it the process of
21 getting permits and approvals and conditional land
22 use?

23 MR. MAENDEL: It's getting the permits
24 that makes it nearly impossible.

25 MR. YEE: Right, thank you. Oh, one

1 other question. You mentioned that you are using
2 an above-ground tank. Have you ever any odour
3 complaints?

4 MR. MAENDEL: One neighbour has
5 complained, yes. We're living out of town, and
6 it's an agriculture section.

7 MR. YEE: So what's the nearest
8 neighbour and the nearest town, or how close, I
9 should say?

10 MR. MAENDEL: The nearest neighbour to
11 that tank would be within one mile.

12 MR. YEE: Thank you.

13 THE CHAIRMAN: Do you have any current
14 plans to split and start a new colony?

15 MR. MAENDEL: No. Do you have any
16 more questions, Wayne?

17 MR. MOTHERAL: No.

18 THE CHAIRMAN: Thank you very much,
19 Mr. Maendel.

20 MR. MAENDEL: Thank you.

21 THE CHAIRMAN: Mr. Graydon? Could you
22 please state your name for the record?

23 MR. GRAYDON: Cliff Graydon.

24 CLIFF GRAYDON, having been sworn, presents as
25 follows:

1 THE CHAIRMAN: Thank you. Go ahead,
2 sir.

3 MR. GRAYDON: Thank you, Mr. Chairman.
4 I would like to thank the Commission for the
5 opportunity to make a presentation. I apologize
6 that I don't have a written presentation for you,
7 but my secretary leaves for work at seven in the
8 morning.

9 THE CHAIRMAN: We won't tell her you
10 said that.

11 MR. GRAYDON: And I don't know what a
12 period is on a computer, so you will have to bear
13 with me.

14 I will give you a bit of background.
15 My name is Cliff Graydon. I'm a grain and cattle
16 producer in the Woodmore area. I am the second
17 generation, and expect a third generation on the
18 same farm to go. And maybe the fourth generation,
19 because he is three years old and likes John Deere
20 tractors.

21 However, the farm that I grew up on,
22 and that I operate, that farm was like many other
23 farms. It was a 240 acre farm. It's now a 1,000
24 acre farm. And I have bought the farms around me
25 because of the economies of scale, as has been

1 presented here today. We just need to do more in
2 order to support our families.

3 The perception in the communities --
4 and I am not going to point fingers at any
5 community, but the perception in the communities
6 is that whether it's grain or livestock or hogs,
7 we are the culprits in pollution. That seems to
8 be the perception, the general perception,
9 throughout Manitoba and Canada, for that matter.

10 However, I would like to point out
11 that farmers are the stewards of the land. And we
12 have done an excellent job, over the years,
13 without regulations. To protect what we have
14 today, to be handed down to me today, my father
15 looked after the place. He didn't have a big
16 expensive manure spreader. And it was called a
17 stone boat, it wasn't called a manure boat. It
18 was called a stone boat because it had two
19 applications. In the winter time you hauled the
20 manure out of the barn with it. And in the
21 summertime, you hauled the stones off the field
22 with it. So that's what we used. And you didn't
23 get very far from the yard. And no one got too
24 far from any of the yards in those days on any
25 quarter section. And those fields still produce

1 very well today. So without regulations, we have
2 been able to pass these farms down.

3 And then along came regulations, and
4 we have done a much better job, a much, much
5 better job. And I agree that the farms have
6 become bigger because of the economics of scale.
7 But no one on the farms have died from drinking
8 raw milk, but we can't buy raw milk anymore. It
9 has been regulated out. We can't do that. I
10 don't understand why, but we can't.

11 No one else has died from pollution on
12 a farm. We all have to drink that water on the
13 farm. And if we're looking at the family farm, I
14 think the well-being of the family farm, and the
15 neighbouring farms, I would say that they are our
16 livelihood. And we have looked after them. And
17 we want to look after them, again, to pass them on
18 to the next generation.

19 This hearing is titled "Clean
20 Environment Commission", that's what your title
21 is, I understand. I'm sure that that's what it
22 is.

23 THE CHAIRMAN: That's correct.

24 MR. GRAYDON: So that would imply that
25 we have to clean something up. That's what it

1 implies to the general public, and that's what it
2 implied to me when I heard it. And I'm not sure
3 what is dirty in our country? I don't know that
4 we've identified that. And we need to identify
5 that before we can start cleaning it up, in my
6 mind.

7 A temporary moratorium on hogs implies
8 that they were the dirty culprits. I would like
9 to make you aware that some of the small facts
10 about pigs is they have the smallest lungs of any
11 mammal, so they need the cleanest air in order to
12 survive. They only perform well with clean water,
13 human-quality water. So there is no farm
14 operation, no hog operation, that's going to
15 pollute his own well. And they aren't all in a
16 row, so they are not polluting anyone. And so
17 they are going to look after it the best that they
18 can.

19 The environment is our concern. And,
20 in my personal experience, on my farm, the natural
21 fertilizer has outperformed any commercial
22 fertilizers on the hay crops that I grow, and also
23 on the grain crops. It has a longer-lasting
24 effect on the grain crops and on the hay land.

25 If we're concerned about the

1 environment, if we're really concerned about the
2 environment, I would suggest that the
3 manufacturing of fertilizers has more impact on
4 the environment than my cows do belching. My use
5 of natural fertilizer is sustainable, versus the
6 use of a renewable resources to manufacture the
7 fertilizers, that's not sustainable.

8 I was part of a presentation to your
9 scoping commission, perhaps you are aware of that,
10 or remember that.

11 THE CHAIRMAN: I recall.

12 MR. GRAYDON: We were representing the
13 SPADA organization. And at that time we indicated
14 that we had been involved in a number of studies
15 and trials. We also indicated that we would not
16 be able to afford to make a presentation, a proper
17 presentation, from that organization. And you
18 suggested that there was funding available. So we
19 spent considerable amount of time, and effort, to
20 obtain that funding, and we weren't able to obtain
21 it. Had we been able to obtain that, we could
22 have brought a lot of valuable information to your
23 Commission. This valuable information probably
24 will not be forthcoming.

25 In short, what it indicated was that a

1 study on the Roseau River, from the border to the
2 Red River, had no N or P loading in the livestock
3 areas. However, when we came into the grain land,
4 there was some loading. And that's what it
5 indicated. And that's a short form, that's the
6 short model, but that's the best I can do.

7 The application of natural fertilizer
8 improved soil till and productivity. And because
9 we were doing trials, we had to know what the
10 productivity was. And, in many cases, it was four
11 to ten times that of a controlled, and double to
12 three times of fertilizer, of commercial
13 fertilizer, because we did it all.

14 And even when we grossly over-applied
15 on a certain plot, we didn't have leaching. We
16 did deep nitrate testing. We didn't have a
17 problem with that. And that information is
18 available. But to present it properly, I can't do
19 that here.

20 The SPADA organization has done a
21 considerable amount of base work long before
22 environmental concerns arose anywhere. They are a
23 well-reputed organization of dedicated volunteers
24 who have worked in the community for over 25
25 years. It's unfortunate that the powers that be

1 did not see fit to fund our proposal.

2 On my own operation, my brother and I
3 went into the hog business 10 years ago. It's 15
4 years ago, actually. Prior to the start-up, we
5 went into a biotech barn, the straw-based units.,
6 prior to our putting business in the barns, we
7 decided that we needed to know. We were concerned
8 about the environment. We needed to know if there
9 was leaching in these situations.

10 We did perimeter wells around the
11 barns. We did a well inside a barn. And we had
12 PFRA come out and test it. One of the wells,
13 initially, was contaminated. High nitrates.
14 There had been nothing there before. That was
15 natural. And there were no pigs in the barn yet,
16 you have to understand that. After 10 years, we
17 tested them again. There was no difference in any
18 of the wells.

19 Our neighbour decided to build the
20 same type of unit. And he built five to ten miles
21 south, nine miles south of my place. We put in
22 the perimeter wells, tested them, and every well
23 was contaminated with nitrates. That was natural.
24 That quarter had never been homesteaded. All it
25 had ever had was cattle pastures on it. It was

1 contaminated. That was natural.

2 By today's standards, maybe the
3 levels -- maybe our testing is better. I don't
4 really know. But after ten years of our
5 operation, nothing had changed.

6 Our industry, agriculture, more
7 particularly hogs, have some of the stiffest
8 regulations of anywhere in the world. So if the
9 perception is that hogs are polluting the lake,
10 let's stop production. But let's prove that they
11 are doing that before we stop production. Before
12 we have a temporary moratorium, we should know
13 that they are doing that.

14 If, however, the City of Winnipeg is
15 polluting the lake, let's stop flushing. Let's do
16 that. Does the floral problem in the lake have
17 anything to do with the hydro dam? Has it
18 happened before, before the hydro dams? Do we
19 have any track record on that? Do we know how
20 much problem it's really causing, or are we just
21 assuming that? I sincerely hope that the
22 Commission's mandate is not a witch hunt, because
23 agriculture is sustainable. We're natural and we
24 are sustainable. And we are good stewards of the
25 land because we have to drink our own water.

1 Thank you very much.

2 THE CHAIRMAN: Thank you, Mr. Graydon.
3 I can assure you that our mandate is not to be
4 witch hunters. Can I just ask you a couple of
5 question about your application for funding? How
6 much did your organization request?

7 MR. GRAYDON: Somewhere around
8 \$20,000.

9 THE CHAIRMAN: Well, that was probably
10 the problem, because we had a limited amount of
11 funding for this project. And we put a limit of
12 \$5,000 on any single application. If you're able
13 to do any work for that amount of money, I'm sure
14 that we might be able to make arrangements to
15 advance that much but, unfortunately, no more than
16 that.

17 MR. GRAYDON: It would have been nice
18 to have been informed of that.

19 THE CHAIRMAN: I'm surprised that you
20 weren't. There is still time. We haven't closed
21 off that funding program, so there is still time.
22 And perhaps if you indicate to us how we can be in
23 touch with you, if you leave that information with
24 Joyce at the back table.

25 MR. GRAYDON: Okay.

1 THE CHAIRMAN: We will discuss it
2 further with you.

3 MR. GRAYDON: We were hiring a
4 professional consultant to do that the job.

5 THE CHAIRMAN: No, I realize that.
6 And we did have more than just your application
7 that requested a significant amount of money to
8 hire a professional consultant, but we weren't
9 able to accommodate any of those groups because of
10 this cap. And I apologize that you weren't
11 informed of the cap, and you probably should have
12 been.

13 MR. GRAYDON: I appreciate that.

14 THE CHAIRMAN: Wayne, any questions?

15 MR. MOTHERAL: I just want to comment
16 on some of the research that you could help us
17 with, with phosphorus or nitrogen movement in
18 soils. We do have the Deerwood Water and Soil
19 Association, who are doing some of that research.
20 And they have already given us some of their
21 research results, so. We are trying our damndest
22 to get all we can on that process, so it's
23 something we need to know.

24 MR. GRAYDON: There are a number of --
25 there is an ongoing trial right now, in

1 conjunction with one of the large hog operations,
2 and with the University of Manitoba in the
3 Marchand area, which we also contribute from the
4 SPADA organization. We contribute to that
5 research. And they did a report, as late as last
6 Wednesday, in Friedensfeld. And that report, or
7 that trial, is being run by Kim Ominski. And
8 that's from the University of Manitoba, Professor
9 Ominski. Don Flatten is involved. And two or
10 three doctors and scientists are also involved.
11 But we have a bunch of information and trials that
12 were run and completed, yes.

13 MR. MOTHERAL: Yes, we are very aware
14 of the issue. Anyway, we need to get some more
15 information on that, that's for sure.

16 MR. GRAYDON: Thank you.

17 MR. MOTHERAL: That's all I have.

18 MR. YEE: Just one question, I guess,
19 Mr. Graydon. Just how large is your -- I realize
20 that you are a cattle producer. How large is your
21 operation?

22 MR. GRAYDON: How long have I been a
23 cattle producer?

24 MR. YEE: How large is your operation?
25 How many cattle?

1 MR. GRAYDON: I run 199 cows.

2 MR. YEE: So does that require a
3 Manure Management Plan?

4 MR. GRAYDON: No, it doesn't.

5 MR. YEE: Thank you.

6 MR. GRAYDON: Thank you.

7 THE CHAIRMAN: Are you still in the
8 hog operation?

9 MR. GRAYDON: No. We were,
10 unfortunately, too small to compete, and so we
11 quit.

12 THE CHAIRMAN: You know, when you were
13 talking about this trial near Marchand, and you
14 mentioned Dr. Flatten, he is one of the people
15 that we have engaged to do some literature review
16 on our behalf. So he may well, through him, or
17 through Kim Ominski, make us aware of some of
18 these issues.

19 MR. GRAYDON: That was a good choice
20 on your part.

21 THE CHAIRMAN: Well, we have engaged
22 the three senior people from the University of
23 Manitoba faculty. And they have, in turn, engaged
24 other professors and, I think, mostly graduate
25 students to help them with the work. They will be

1 reporting to us, about the end of June, on a
2 number of different issues. But all of them are
3 sort of the key issues that are linked to the hog
4 industry in Manitoba.

5 MR. GRAYDON: Could I ask you a
6 question, Mr. Chairman?

7 THE CHAIRMAN: Certainly.

8 MR. GRAYDON: Is your mandate only
9 hogs?

10 THE CHAIRMAN: It is.

11 MR. GRAYDON: So any recommendations
12 you make will have no bearing on any other parts
13 of agriculture?

14 THE CHAIRMAN: Well, I can't promise
15 you that. But our mandate is specifically in
16 respect of hog production. Not even the hog
17 processing, but hog production. I'm sure that
18 there may be some issues that we address that have
19 a carry-over to manure management in other
20 livestock, but we won't be specifically looking at
21 other livestock.

22 MR. GRAYDON: Okay, thank you.

23 THE CHAIRMAN: Thank you very much for
24 coming out this afternoon.

25 MR. GRAYDON: Thank you for hearing

1 me.

2 THE CHAIRMAN: We don't have anybody
3 else registered to speak right now. There is a
4 gentleman that is coming at about 3:00. If
5 anybody else wants to make a presentation right
6 now, we will -- you can come forward. Did you
7 want to say something?

8 MR. MAENDEL: I've got a question.

9 THE CHAIRMAN: Can you come up to a
10 mike, please, and identify yourself?

11 MR. MAENDEL: Is it on?

12 THE CHAIRMAN: Yes.

13 MR. GRAYDON: I am from the Blue Clay
14 Colony. I'm the secretary treasurer from the Blue
15 Clay Farm.

16 THE CHAIRMAN: And what was your name?

17 MR. MAENDEL: Mike Maendel. Since you
18 have only, as you say, targeted the hog industry,
19 does that mean the hog industry is guilty, or we
20 are proved to be guilty until we are found
21 innocent?

22 THE CHAIRMAN: Well, we don't consider
23 it that way.

24 MR. MAENDEL: That's the approach
25 you've taken?

1 THE CHAIRMAN: That's not the approach
2 we've taken. You know, we have been asked to look
3 into the environmental sustainability of the hog
4 industry. We have identified a number of
5 different areas that we feel we need to examine,
6 in order to complete that review or that
7 investigation. But our goal is to -- ultimately,
8 our goal is to be able to say to the government
9 that with what you have in place now, or with what
10 we might recommend additionally, or in addition,
11 that the hog industry can very well continue
12 sustainably. But we have no intention of trying
13 to shut down the hog industry, or even curb its
14 existence in the province.

15 MR. MAENDEL: Thank you.

16 THE CHAIRMAN: You're welcome,
17 Mr. Maendel. Yes?

18 MR. PENNER: I did not --

19 THE CHAIRMAN: Please come to a mike
20 so that it's on the record. And, for the record,
21 even though most of us know who you are, can you
22 identify yourself, please?

23 MR. PENNER: My name is Jack Penner.
24 I am the Member of the Legislature for this area.
25 And I was wondering if I can make a short verbal

1 presentation?

2 THE CHAIRMAN: Absolutely.

3 MR. PENNER: Although, I had not
4 indicated that I would speak or that I intended
5 to. I was waiting for some material that I might
6 present at a later date. But if you would allow
7 me to?

8 THE CHAIRMAN: Absolutely.

9 MR. MOTHERAL: I will say that what I
10 just said to Mr. Chairman, it sure would be nice
11 if I could rule you out of order.

12 THE CHAIRMAN: I can't imagine
13 Mr. Penner ever being out of order.

14 MR. PENNER: Well, thank you very
15 much, Mr. Chairman, for making the allowance to
16 allow me to say a few words.

17 I am the Member of the Legislature for
18 this area. And I have been maybe for longer than
19 I should have stayed. Because it was always my
20 view that a politician's tenure -- and I heard
21 what the honourable gentleman said from Blue Clay
22 about politicians. And I just want to say that it
23 has always been my intention that a politician's
24 tenure should be no more than ten years. And I
25 had hoped that that would be my case. But,

1 however, once I did become that politician, and
2 the forces of nature in the political system take
3 place, you sometimes extend your stay.

4 I want to say this to the honourable
5 gentleman that did make that comment: I believe
6 that most politicians are very sincere in what
7 they do. I believe that most politicians are
8 worth their weight in gold. However, we, as a
9 society, sometimes treat them in a manner that I
10 believe is not becoming of their true nature and
11 their abilities and their honesty. And I say that
12 about most politicians, not all.

13 I want also to say to you, the
14 Commission: I truly appreciate you taking the
15 time and taking a hard look at an industry that I
16 believe has been treated with some disdain, and I
17 choose words carefully, by some people because of
18 the smell that the hog industry generates when
19 they operate, and operate properly.

20 I want to, first of all, say that I am
21 a politician. I used to be a Minister of the
22 Crown. I know the government system well. But
23 above all, I'm a farmer. We farm six miles
24 northwest of here, have all my life. We are a
25 fourth generation farm operation. And one of my

1 sons was given the honour of being the Young
2 Farmer of the Year Award about four years ago.
3 And so I like to think we run a pretty fair
4 operation. I pride myself in running a pretty
5 clean operation.

6 I think most of our operations are
7 done largely from a scientific perspective. We
8 love to test our soils. We like to apply
9 nutrients to ensure that the longevity of our soil
10 will be maintained, as I believe most farmers do
11 these days.

12 And we allow a hog operation to
13 utilize part of our farm to spread manure when
14 that operation runs out of land, or the nutrient
15 values of the product that they have to apply to
16 the land are such that their land base isn't large
17 enough. That works well for us, and that works
18 well for them. We strongly believe in making sure
19 that the proper testing is done of the product
20 that is put on the land. We know that our
21 future -- our young grandson that is now at
22 university in soil science, and our young
23 granddaughter, who is majoring in psychology, ask
24 me not whether the farm has anything to do with
25 her entering that field. But we feel that that

1 generation, the younger generation, will be much
2 better equipped than I was when starting farming,
3 and will be much better equipped to continue the
4 farming operation in a sustainable and
5 environmentally friendly way.

6 The only way that I believe that we
7 are going to be able to continue to farm in an
8 economical manner is if society realizes how great
9 a need for proper technology we have, and how vast
10 the changes are that have been made on our farms.
11 When I started farming, we met with people from
12 the universities, soil scientists, and they said
13 that if we -- they told us that if we kept on
14 farming the way our forefathers had farmed, our
15 father and our grandfather, that in 50 years' time
16 our land base will not produce a good crop,
17 because we would have mined the soil to the point
18 where it would have become non-productive.

19 However, we changed. We started soil
20 testing, I believe, in the early sixties when that
21 became the thing to do, and we have soil tested
22 ever since. We have applied our nutrients based
23 on those soil tests on our farm. We believe that
24 the productivity of our soil is twice what it was
25 when we -- when I first started farming. And we

1 believe that the quality of our land is much, much
2 better than it was when we took it over.

3 In 1988, when I first became elected,
4 our soil was virtually all bull bore plowed, and
5 it was black. We prided ourselves on being good
6 farmers, because good farmers had good black soil
7 to start their spring with. And that was the
8 mentality at that time.

9 In 1988, when I had been the president
10 of the farm organization of Keystone Agriculture
11 Producers, until that time. And the media had
12 followed me around, or wanted to follow me around
13 one day. They came over to our farm and the dust
14 storm was so bad that they could not use their
15 cameras to take pictures. And I will never forget
16 that day.

17 But we changed -- from 1988 until now,
18 we have changed in the last 20 years how we have
19 managed our farms and how we have managed our
20 soils. Today you can't -- you can hardly find a
21 field that is still exposed to the elements the
22 way it was then. Most of it is either minimum
23 till or zero till. And cover is what we need in
24 order to keep that soil on the farm.

25 Secondly, the drainages that we make

1 are totally different than the ones that we used
2 to make. And our soil is so flat that it if we
3 don't drain properly, we won't produce a crop.

4 And I think last summer, again, proved
5 how vulnerable we were to heavy rains and
6 significant flooding during the summer months. So
7 our drainages are totally different, designed
8 totally differently, than they were. Our culverts
9 are sized to allow only a given amount of water
10 off the land. Because the more water we keep on
11 the land, the better our soil will be able to
12 utilize that moisture to grow a crop. That's
13 proper management. And I believe we, as farmers,
14 have done an absolute fabulous job in that
15 respect.

16 And yet, when I hear the people now
17 talking about Lake Winnipeg, and when I look at
18 the -- at the photos that were generated by
19 satellite from 450 miles up, and I have used the
20 term before, they are 450 mile pictures that we
21 see. They are colour-enhanced. And for what
22 purpose? To create an image. To create an image.
23 And that image has given you, the farmers, and
24 myself, an image in the City of Winnipeg, or
25 Brandon, or in the urban centers of our countries

1 and the world, really.

2 We are being painted with a brush that
3 I think is simply not correct. I think we are
4 being talked about in a manner that is not
5 correct. I believe that we owe the farm community
6 a bit of a better position in society for being
7 good stewards of the land and good
8 environmentalists.

9 And, you know, this young generation
10 that will follow me knows far better than any
11 other young generation that we've seen before us
12 how and what to do on that land, and with that
13 land, to sustain it over the long term and make it
14 produce better than what it has done before
15 because they have the technology, that same
16 technology that was used to measure the green
17 depth of algae in Lake Winnipeg.

18 I would suspect if we did the same
19 analysis, computer analysis, or satellite analysis
20 of Lake of the Woods, which runs into Lake
21 Winnipeg, down the Winnipeg River, you would see a
22 picture that is so similar to Lake Winnipeg. And
23 nobody says anything about Lake of the Woods. And
24 when you look at Lake Winnipeg, and where the
25 Winnipeg River runs into the lake, and you look at

1 the satellite pictures, and you do the analysis,
2 why is it that the south end of the lake has
3 hardly any algae? And the Red River runs in at
4 the south end. Look at those pictures. And where
5 the Winnipeg River enters, that's where the algae
6 starts and heads north. And Lake Winnipeg is a
7 flowing lake. I mean, take a hard look at this.
8 And you, I challenge you, the Committee, to take a
9 hard look at this and maybe do some challenges of
10 your own in regards to pointing fingers without
11 scientific evidence.

12 And that's the reason that I wanted to
13 make these comments today because I believe we owe
14 the farm community an apology. And I believe if
15 proper science is used to do the analogy of the
16 water quality in that lake, and then do the
17 analogy of where those -- where the actual
18 impediments lie, we might, in fact, exonerate the
19 farm community. And I believe it is absolutely --
20 I don't disagree with doing a proper analysis of
21 an industry.

22 But I think we have done a disservice
23 to the hog industry in this province. From what I
24 have seen, sure, the hog industry smells different
25 than a cow does, or a chicken does, or a human

1 being does. But when I hear that we can put 7,000
2 or 8,000 tons of raw sewage into a river, in the
3 City of Winnipeg, when their sewage lines break,
4 and not much is said about that, to you, the
5 Commission, I say, if that had ever happened on a
6 hog farm and that amount of manure would have been
7 spilled into the Red River, or the Assiniboine, or
8 the Winnipeg River, what kind of a -- what kind of
9 a backlash would the hog industry, as a whole,
10 have received? So I think we've done a disservice
11 to and singled out an industry based on smell,
12 more than anything else.

13 And I challenge you: Come to my farm.
14 We use hydrous ammonia in the fall of the year,
15 and sometimes in the spring of the year, to
16 fertilize where we can't get good natural products
17 to fertilize. We use hydrous ammonia. Now, that
18 smells much different than hog manure, but that
19 smell will kill you. Hog manure will, too, if you
20 stand in an enclosed area long enough, with those
21 gases coming from that manure. Hog manure will
22 kill you, too. It's the same product, in a sense,
23 but they smell entirely different. And it is
24 smell that has caused, in great -- or in large
25 part, I believe, the problems that the hog

1 industry is facing today.

2 So, therefore, I say to you, I think
3 it is apparent that we, as politicians, think long
4 and hard about how we want this economy to grow in
5 this province, what we want to utilize to grow
6 that economy, and whether we want to keep our
7 young people outside of the urban centers employed
8 in rural parts of our country and grow our rural
9 communities, such as southern Manitoba has
10 demonstrated can happen over the last decade.

11 And I want to close by saying that I
12 was in Germany about five years ago. And I spent
13 nine days in Germany. And I say this to you,
14 that's so critical of the politicians, I spent
15 nine days with the Berlin -- five days with the
16 Berlin government. And I asked them why they
17 would spend the huge amount of money to subsidize
18 their agricultural production, and why they were
19 so serious about keeping those people on the land?
20 And this guy said -- and I speak German well, he
21 said in German to me, I don't know whether you
22 speak German, but he said in German to me, he
23 said: It is much cheaper for us to keep nine
24 million Germans in rural Germany than to bring
25 those nine million Germans into Berlin and build

1 the infrastructure and keep them in Berlin.

2 And I think we have something to learn
3 in this province. We have a huge rural area, with
4 plenty of room for expansion of the agriculture
5 industry. And when I say industry, the primary
6 sector, as well as the processing. It is time we
7 looked positively on those hog producers, and
8 anything else that can produce the raw product.
9 But it is time that we also started attracting the
10 processing industry to follow it.

11 Because it was always our view, it was
12 always my view, that we had made a huge mistake
13 when we put the crow rate in place. Years and
14 years before my time in politics, the crow rate
15 was put in place to give us a cheap method of
16 moving that raw product into a box and shipping it
17 to the coast and dumping it into a boat and
18 exporting it. And I have always said, and I
19 maintain this, and my Minister of Agriculture in
20 this Province has ridiculed me for twelve years,
21 or for eight years. And she has constantly
22 ridiculed me because I supported the dissolution
23 of crow rate.

24 Now, I say to you, the Committee, that
25 doing away with the crow rate has given us the

1 opportunities to grow it here, and finish it here,
2 and process it here, and ship it as a finished
3 product, instead of as a raw product. And if we
4 do it right, we can protect the environment. We
5 can keep our young people here in Manitoba. And
6 we will produce an economy that will be beneficial
7 to all of Manitoba.

8 THE CHAIRMAN: Thank you very much,
9 Mr. Penner. And thank you for your comments.
10 Now, did you indicate the nature of your farm,
11 what you do?

12 MR. PENNER: No, I didn't. When I
13 first started farming, we had about 200 hogs on
14 our farm. We had about 20 head of cattle and
15 about 200 chickens. And it was relatively what,
16 at that time, we would call a diversified farm.
17 We have stopped all livestock. We have no
18 livestock on our farm. My son had a bad truck
19 accident bringing back a load of rolled barley
20 from Winkler. And we had -- at that time, were in
21 the process of building a herd of registered
22 Hereford. And when we virtually broke his back,
23 we stopped the -- we sold our cattle, because he
24 was cowboy.

25 Now, since then, we have diversified

1 into pulse production. We grow a lot of dry beans
2 and soybeans, in a kind of product. Now, we grow
3 very little grain, or wheat, because we can't
4 market that ourselves. We like to market our own
5 stuff. We just finished shipping, by the way, a
6 number of truck loads of beans to California and
7 to Mexico. And we do that right off the farm.
8 And we think that's the way of farms in the
9 future.

10 THE CHAIRMAN: Thank you very much.
11 Thank you for making your presentation this
12 afternoon. Is Mr. Siemens here yet? No. Does
13 anybody else wish to make a presentation now? If
14 not, then, we will take a break. There is some
15 coffee and tea, I think, and doughnuts and cookies
16 at the back of the room. And when Mr. Siemens
17 shows up, we will hear his presentation.

18 (PROCEEDINGS RECESSED AT 2:42 P.M. AND RECONVENED
19 AT 3:10 P.M.)

20 THE CHAIRMAN: I think we will come
21 back to order. The next person to make a
22 presentation is here, so we will just give you a
23 moment to resume your seats. Kurt Siemens. Any
24 one of them is fine. Please state your name for
25 the record?

1 MR. SIEMENS: Kurt Siemens.

2 KURT SIEMENS, having been sworn, presents as
3 follows:

4 THE CHAIRMAN: Thank you very much.
5 You may proceed.

6 MR. SIEMENS: Thank you. My name is
7 Kurt Siemens. I'm an egg farmer in the R.M. of
8 Morris, in between Morris and the Rosenort area.
9 And you are probably wondering what an egg farmer
10 is doing at a hog hearing or Clean Environment
11 Commission? It has to do with livestock. We have
12 livestock, just like the hog producers do. And
13 any policies and changes that would come into
14 effect would definitely affect us, just as much as
15 the hog producer.

16 I operate a barn, together with my
17 wife and two kids. I try to get my two kids to
18 help, that is. We have just under 20,000 layers,
19 which equals about 165 animal units. I want to do
20 my part as a livestock producer to protect our
21 environment, to protect the water, air quality,
22 everything else. And I have done some things on
23 my farm already to get to that state.

24 I was just talking to one gentleman in
25 the back there. He has been on my farm. I

1 retooled my farm in 2000. And I put in a new
2 style of cages in for my laying hens and moved to
3 a dry manure system. The dry manure system is now
4 much easier to handle. The waste is more
5 consistent, and it's easier to apply on to the
6 fields.

7 And at that time, I built a manure
8 storage, too. And I did not know that I needed a
9 permit at that time. And when I did find out, I
10 had the building built already. And I actually
11 got to phone Mr. Stevenson. And he came down to
12 my place very quickly and let me know that I did
13 need a permit. And I was all in favour of doing
14 what I needed to do to be compliant with the
15 permits and the regulations that I needed in
16 Manitoba. And so I'm more than willing to do my
17 part to keep the environment safe.

18 We've also purchased a special
19 spreader for that manure so that we can apply it
20 better. Manure, we know, is a valuable
21 fertilizer. I'm sure you've heard that a lot of
22 times already at these hearings, that it's
23 valuable and can be put to good use. So in
24 purchasing this spreader, we can put on a more
25 accurate amount of manure. And then you can put

1 on a thinner layer so that you won't be
2 over-spreading. I have tested my manure. I don't
3 do it every time I haul. But I have tested it,
4 and I have a fairly good idea of what values are
5 in the manure.

6 I work together with the people that I
7 rent my land to and the neighbouring farmers. We
8 discuss what crops are going on to the fields and
9 how much nitrogen. Not phosphorus, but nitrogen,
10 is in the fields, and at what amounts that I would
11 be spreading. We try, as much as possible, to
12 only spread on a field every three to five years
13 so that we don't over-spread. And the concern
14 that the cropping people have is: I don't get to
15 cover a whole field. Because it's 160-acre field,
16 and I have 20,000 birds, so do I have enough to
17 cover the field? So in that case, I tell them: I
18 am going to spread nice and thin and put a thin
19 layer over the whole field, so that you get a nice
20 coverage. And that way they can -- it is much
21 easier for them to do their cropping decisions
22 about how much extra fertilizer they would be
23 putting on.

24 We also work very well to watch our
25 buffer zones and margins, and how far away we stay

1 from ditches. And we are also in a flood zone.
2 And in our flood zone, we have -- there are some
3 springs where you can't do a whole lot of stuff.
4 So we make sure that any storage that we do have
5 is well protected. Our stockpiles that are
6 outside, or compost, or something of that matter,
7 we make sure that we put it up on top of the dikes
8 so that it is protected for any flood that might
9 come. Because usually when you are stockpiling,
10 you don't know what spring holds. Just like last
11 spring, we got a sudden dose of water that we
12 weren't really expecting.

13 I'm also the Chair of Manitoba Egg
14 Producers. And with that, that's where I got most
15 of my education on how important the environment
16 is to us. And with that, we talked to our
17 producers. We had an annual meeting yesterday.
18 And it was very important that we brought out to
19 those producers that the environment is something
20 we have to take care of, and something we have to
21 do our best to keep for our children and our
22 ancestors.

23 We have had some special sessions for
24 our producers so that they can learn about these
25 new guidelines, new management manure guidelines,

1 and also the new phosphorus regs that are
2 proposed. And we are teaching them about it so
3 that they will understand and be able to be
4 prepared for it.

5 There is also Environmental Farm
6 Plans. I have not done my Environmental Farm
7 Plan, but I know that that's something that I need
8 to do. I am not coming here telling you that I am
9 perfect. I know I have to do better and. I will
10 work at doing better on my farm, and also letting
11 my producers know what they need to do to become
12 better stewards of the land.

13 And the biggest thing for us is the
14 challenges. I have got producers coming up to me
15 and saying: I have got so much paperwork to do
16 already. I have got more work to do than I know
17 what to do with. And so we work on workbooks, and
18 calendars, and that kind of thing, to try to make
19 it easier for them. And so that will be a
20 challenge for producers, hog producers, and even
21 livestock producers, to follow those guidelines
22 and to catch up to them on the costs associated
23 with those.

24 I think that would be it for my
25 presentation. That is just a little bit of my

1 story. And if you have any questions, I would be
2 glad to answer them.

3 THE CHAIRMAN: Thank you very much,
4 Mr. Siemens. In your notes, you're suggesting
5 that the rules for phosphorus, the new phosphorus
6 regulation, is a reasonable regulation?

7 MR. SIEMENS: Well, I think so. And I
8 think those are regulations that are attainable.
9 I know there was a lot of negotiation through the
10 Keystone Agriculture Producers, and with the Water
11 Stewardship Committee. And I think we can. Like
12 I say, it will be a challenge to get there, but I
13 think that's someplace we can reach.

14 THE CHAIRMAN: Thank you.

15 MR. MOTHERAL: On a technical side,
16 you say that you spread your -- or you have your
17 manure. You don't own the land you are spreading
18 on?

19 MR. SIEMENS: I own 80-acres myself.
20 But that is always my last resort for spreading,
21 because I like to spread a little bit further
22 away, so that if I do need a last resort, that I
23 have the time span so that I can spread it on my
24 own land.

25 MR. MOTHERAL: Okay. If you take the

1 manure from all 120,000 or 165, or whatever, and
2 you spread that thinly on the rest of the acres
3 you have, how many was there? 160 was it all?
4 What did you say?

5 MR. SIEMENS: The person that rents my
6 land, he has 420 acres right beside my land. So I
7 have that, plus I have other neighbours that I can
8 spread on.

9 MR. MOTHERAL: Well, my question is,
10 and I'm leading up to it, when you spread it
11 thinly, and you test the manure, how many pounds
12 of actual nitrogen do you get when you spread it
13 all thinly?

14 MR. SIEMENS: I can't answer that. I
15 don't know.

16 MR. MOTHERAL: Okay.

17 MR. SIEMENS: I don't have that
18 documentation with me. And it was, I think, two
19 and a half years ago, that was the last time I
20 tested my manure.

21 MR. MOTHERAL: Okay. Your very first
22 statement:

23 "I am concerned with these hearings
24 because they will affect all livestock
25 producers."

1 What concerns or, really, I don't think you would
2 call them fears, but what concerns would you have
3 with the final report, if we have a final report,
4 that we give to a Minister? What would you not
5 want to see in it?

6 MR. SIEMENS: I wouldn't want to see
7 losing any farmers in Manitoba. I wouldn't want
8 to see losing livestock farmers in Manitoba
9 because the rules are too stringent. Make them so
10 that we save the environment, or better the
11 environment. But also there is more than
12 livestock producers that are contributing to this
13 phosphorus load.

14 MR. MOTHERAL: Right.

15 MR. SIEMENS: So let society, in
16 general, share in that improvement. If it is too
17 stringent, we are going to start losing some of
18 those livestock producers. And, yes, there is
19 always loss there is, but let's still have farming
20 communities out in the country.

21 MR. MOTHERAL: Thank you. And I am
22 just going to ask you a question. If our report,
23 and this is only as an assumption, led to extra
24 regulations, and those extra regulations usually
25 come from the general public, because the general

1 public demands more, do you feel as though the
2 general public should be helping pay for some of
3 these regulations, rather than the farmers
4 themselves?

5 MR. SIEMENS: That's quite an
6 assumption. Yes, I do believe that society, as a
7 whole, should help. Because if society is getting
8 the benefits, why shouldn't they help pay us for
9 some of that?

10 MR. MOTHERAL: Well, we have heard
11 that in a couple of presentations. And it is
12 something that --

13 MR. SIEMENS: I am glad I am not a
14 whole lot different than anybody else.

15 MR. MOTHERAL: That's all I have right
16 now, Mr. Chairman.

17 THE CHAIRMAN: Edwin?

18 MR. YEE: Yes. Mr. Siemens, along the
19 same lines we have heard before, and you mentioned
20 it in your presentation, about the amount of
21 paperwork, and that it's time-consuming, we have
22 heard this from a number of producers how
23 time-consuming it is to meet the regulations.
24 Maybe I could just get your comments. Is there
25 anything you would like to see the government do

1 to assist the producer in addressing this part of
2 the, I guess, compliance with the regulations, in
3 terms of helping out?

4 MR. SIEMENS: I don't know if there is
5 a whole lot more that government can do. They do
6 have workshops. And like with the Environmental
7 Farm Plans, I think that's a good step. I think
8 it's more -- my organization is Manitoba Egg
9 Producers. We have to take all of those rules and
10 regulations and turn them into farmer language, if
11 you know what I mean.

12 And we have a -- I'll tell you a
13 little bit about a system that we have, it is
14 called Start Clean Stately. And it is our food
15 safety system that we have for eggs. And it
16 started in 1990. It's a national system. And we
17 have been working on it since then, improving it
18 since then. About four years ago, together with
19 some of the staff at our board, we put up a
20 calendar. It's just a check calendar. It has got
21 every month on it. And on that calendar, every
22 day is on there, and these are the checklists that
23 you have to go through every day to have a safe
24 food product. Now, intertwined with that there is
25 some environmental stuff. And there is also

1 animal care issues that are all wrapped up into
2 it. So those are some of the things that we can
3 do.

4 What government can do, I don't know.
5 You might have to give me a little bit of time to
6 think on that one. But, don't worry, I will come
7 back and ask for some more stuff later.

8 THE CHAIRMAN: And just following on
9 that thought, could the government somehow help in
10 doing some of that translating it into farmer
11 language?

12 MR. SIEMENS: If government can talk
13 the farmer language, then yes. Well, sometimes
14 there is that disconnect. I know they try. And
15 I'm sure you guys have experienced farmers, some
16 of you might also -- I think Mr. Motheral was a
17 farmer, or is still, a farmer?

18 MR. MOTHERAL: Well, I still am, I
19 guess.

20 MR. SIEMENS: I think I know your
21 brother. And that helps to have people that have
22 that farming backgrounds on these panels who know,
23 because then you can put it in a little bit easier
24 language for us to understand. And there is some
25 farmers out there that just say: Leave me alone.

1 I have got my own little area. This is the way I
2 have been doing it for 40 years, so don't bother
3 me. And that message has to be brought to those
4 farmers in a simple enough way so that they can
5 understand it and that they feel that they can
6 attain those levels.

7 MR. YEE: No, that was it. I
8 appreciate that. Thank you.

9 THE CHAIRMAN: I don't think I have
10 any further questions. Wayne?

11 MR. MOTHERAL: It wouldn't be my
12 brother. It's a cousin. I have no brothers.

13 MR. SIEMENS: Howard?

14 MR. MOTHERAL: Yes.

15 MR. SIEMENS: Sorry.

16 THE CHAIRMAN: Thank you very much,
17 Mr. Siemens.

18 MR. SIEMENS: Thank you for your time.

19 THE CHAIRMAN: Now, is there anyone
20 else who wishes to make a presentation this
21 afternoon? There doesn't appear to be. We will
22 adjourn now. We will stay here a while, and we
23 will come back at 7:00. Although, at the present
24 time, we have nobody registered to speak this
25 evening. But we will come and be here at 7:00,

1 just in case anybody else shows up and wishes to
2 make a presentation this evening. So we will
3 adjourn now. If any of you -- if somebody does
4 show up before 5:00, or if any of you change your
5 mind and feel you need to say something, just let
6 us know and we will hear you. Thank you very
7 much.

8 (PROCEEDINGS RECESSED AT 3:25 P.M. AND RECONVENED
9 AT 7:05 P.M)

10 THE CHAIRMAN: Okay. We will come
11 back to order. Good evening. Thank you for
12 coming out. Mr. Hunter, do you want to come up
13 and take the hot seat?

14 MR. HUNTER: Where do you want me?

15 THE CHAIRMAN: Well, any of those
16 mikes up at that front table. Please state your
17 name for the record?

18 MR. HUNTER: My name is Archie Hunter,
19 Reeve of the R.M. of Franklin.
20 Archie Hunter, having been sworn, presents as
21 follows:

22 THE CHAIRMAN: Thank you. And you may
23 proceed.

24 MR. HUNTER: Well, I am going to be
25 quite short to the Commission. We're a

1 neighbouring municipality here. And as far as the
2 hog situation, we've been operating with a by-law.
3 We are not into the planning, or anything like
4 that, yet. We will be back. But we've kept our
5 municipality pretty clean from hogs, strictly with
6 a by-law that I will just sort of explain to you.

7 Now, if somebody comes in, for
8 example, and wants to put up a hog barn, probably
9 the first thing that council looks at is, is it a
10 corporation or is it a farm, family farm? What we
11 have found out, over the years, the corporations,
12 and I'm not knocking the corporations, they do a
13 lot of good things for Manitoba, but they have a
14 different outlook. Once that barn is put up, they
15 don't really care about the neighbours, or
16 whatever, and I will say that honestly. Once a
17 barn is there, and the smell is there, they're
18 gone. They could be investors, or whatever. The
19 family farm, we take a real hard look at that and
20 look at the situation. And we have a by-law
21 that -- one of the stipulations of that by-law is
22 that we ask them to ask for a five kilometer
23 radius around that barn, so that nobody else can
24 build a barn in there. That has worked really
25 well for the R.M. of Franklin. And the operators

1 seem to think that's a good project.

2 The other thing, if that company or
3 corporation, or family farm, wants to build that
4 barn, he has to go to people within that five mile
5 radius and get their signatures saying that it's
6 okay. Now, sometimes you can run into a buzz saw
7 there, as well. You might get three guys say:
8 Yes, we agree with it. The other three say no.
9 And then council will have to make that decision.

10 I will reiterate the difference
11 between a family farm and a corporate farm. We
12 really rely on the family farm. If they live
13 beside the farm, they just seem to look after it
14 better, and all of the other things that go with
15 that. Whereas the corporations, we have had some
16 trouble with the corporations where there has been
17 a couple of barns going up. And as far as
18 managing it and looking after it, we don't get
19 much response. So I think that we have kept the
20 R.M. of Franklin pretty clean. We have a few
21 barns, but not too many, and I think that our
22 by-laws control that.

23 I do have to say, on behalf of
24 council, that there are areas in Manitoba that I
25 feel where there are too many barns lumped

1 together. We have our water quality and
2 everything else that we are concerned about. And
3 I think it's gone too far in certain areas. But
4 I'm happy to say that I think that the R.M. of
5 Franklin, with our by-law, has done a good job of
6 all this.

7 And I hope that's some information for
8 the Commission to take back with you. That's how
9 we did it. We have had a few guys pretty mad at
10 us, some of the companies. But all of a sudden
11 now we're look pretty clean. And I have to say
12 that I am proud of our council for putting the
13 work into that by-law. And you can drive through
14 our municipality, and we look pretty good, I
15 think. And so I thank you for your time. And I
16 hope that that means something and helps the
17 Commission.

18 THE CHAIRMAN: Just hang on a second.
19 We may have a question or two. Wayne?

20 MR. MOTHERAL: Certainly, I'm not
21 going to let Mr. Hunter away without being
22 questioned. So when you say that you have
23 distinguished -- you distinguish between a
24 corporate farm and a family farm, do you, as a
25 council, have a certain set of criteria to

1 distinguish that, or is it a council meeting and
2 you decide there? You must have some kind of
3 criteria?

4 MR. HUNTER: Yes, we do. Like, when
5 they fill out the form for the application for the
6 barn, what we do ask them for is the family
7 members that are going to be involved. If it's
8 three brothers, or there is two other
9 brother-in-laws that are involved that are
10 supplying some of the money, then we go through
11 that.

12 MR. MOTHERAL: Okay.

13 MR. HUNTER: They don't have to supply
14 that information, as you know, but usually they
15 do.

16 MR. MOTHERAL: And one thing I can
17 see, you are probably pleased with the Planning
18 Act, the way that it says the municipality still
19 has the final say as to your land use planning.
20 And you're using that as a perfect example. You
21 still have the final say.

22 MR. HUNTER: Right.

23 MR. MOTHERAL: When you say also, and
24 you said this at the start that you've kept your
25 municipality, I think the word you said was "free

1 of hogs." Do you have any ILOs in the
2 municipality?

3 MR. HUNTER: Yes, we do. Yes, we do.
4 We've allowed a few.

5 MR. MOTHERAL: Yes.

6 MR. HUNTER: It depends on the
7 location. And, like I said, within that five mile
8 radius, if that person wants to put a barn up
9 there, he has to go talk to those ratepayers and
10 landowners. And then they have to sign a form for
11 them. They have to sell that barn to them.

12 MR. MOTHERAL: No, I understand that.
13 That's, of course, being proactive before
14 something happens.

15 MR. HUNTER: Right.

16 MR. MOTHERAL: That's all I have right
17 now. I might have something, in just a moment,
18 after thinking about this.

19 MR. YEE: Mr. Hunter, just for
20 clarification here, the five kilometer radius,
21 does that mean that no other barns can be within
22 that five kilometer radius?

23 MR. HUNTER: Yes, that's right. What
24 we do is we would discuss the barn situation. And
25 it can be a corporation, or it can be a family

1 farm. And we would ask them if they would require
2 that five kilometers, which is, approximately,
3 three miles.

4 MR. YEE: Right.

5 MR. HUNTER: And every one of them are
6 happy to have that.

7 MR. YEE: And in the case of
8 neighbours, if there are neighbours within that
9 five kilometers, they have to give their
10 permission for it?

11 MR. HUNTER: That's exactly right,
12 written permission. And that company, it could be
13 a family farm, has to come in with those
14 signatures.

15 MR. YEE: Has the municipality
16 received many applications from corporations for
17 development of barns?

18 MR. HUNTER: Yes, we have. At the
19 start, eight years ago, we had several
20 applications, and some of them were granted. But
21 I would say three out of eight maybe were granted.
22 And the other five were turned down strictly
23 because of the neighbouring residents not being
24 satisfied.

25 MR. YEE: Thank you.

1 THE CHAIRMAN: Are the residents of
2 your municipality generally pleased with this
3 by-law and how it operates?

4 MR. HUNTER: Yes, they really are. I
5 just wanted to say one thing. We have the Roseau
6 River that runs through the heart of our
7 municipality. There is a lot of cabins, and there
8 is a lot of active people along that river fishing
9 and whatnot. And they want that kept, and the
10 R.M. does, too.

11 MR. MOTHERAL: I have one more
12 question. Does your by-law prohibit, say, a
13 family farm from expanding, a smaller operation?

14 MR. HUNTER: Okay. We will take a
15 look at what they want to do, as far as expansion,
16 like you explained. And we would probably treat
17 them, well, the same as anybody else, if it's --
18 if it can work, they will be granted that
19 application.

20 MR. MOTHERAL: Okay. So you have to
21 look at everything. You can't -- somebody can't
22 say: I fit this criteria. You would still have
23 to go through the council's approval process?

24 MR. HUNTER: Yes, exactly right. When
25 I mention corporations, and I mention family

1 farms, I guess I shouldn't divide that, but we do.
2 There is a difference. Just with our experience,
3 and the knowledge that we have working with those
4 people. And we try to work with everybody. And
5 sometimes you get cooperation much better from the
6 family farm. They live there. They are beside
7 the barn. And, like I say, we have got a pretty
8 green country out there, and we want to keep it
9 that way. But over the years we have, all of us,
10 have had some hand in destroying some of our
11 natural good things.

12 MR. MOTHERAL: One more question.

13 THE CHAIRMAN: Sure.

14 MR. HUNTER: I knew you wouldn't let
15 me off the hook.

16 MR. MOTHERAL: I have known from him
17 in the past, and he would do the same thing to me.
18 No, I don't mean that.

19 MR. HUNTER: I wouldn't.

20 MR. MOTHERAL: Oh, what was I going to
21 say now? Oh, man, I'm having a senior's moment.
22 I thought it was a really good point. I will
23 think about it, if anybody else wants to say
24 something.

25 MR. YEE: Yes. Mr. Hunter, I have one

1 more question. In terms of the approval process,
2 do you find working with the Technical Review
3 Committees satisfactory, in terms of the process,
4 or have you had any problems with that process or
5 those reviews?

6 MR. HUNTER: Do you want me to be
7 honest here?

8 MR. YEE: Absolutely.

9 THE CHAIRMAN: Absolutely.

10 MR. HUNTER: At one time the technical
11 review was sort of composed of people that were
12 pro-hogs. We've noted that. We do know that.
13 And it's a tough thing for me to say here in front
14 of the mike, but it seemed like very few of those
15 hog applications were turned down, even in areas
16 where they had to know that there was too many
17 barns there already. But I don't know of how many
18 applications were turned down. And I'm being
19 honest about that. And that's what went wrong in
20 some of these areas.

21 MR. MOTHERAL: I remember what my
22 question was now. Okay, I am just going to put
23 out another scenario. You have your by-laws now
24 entrenched in your municipality about this five
25 kilometer radius. What happens, and you realize

1 that you have an election process to go through,
2 what happens if that whole council goes out, that
3 council can say: Let's change them by-laws.
4 That's pretty legitimate, then. That's that
5 political process?

6 MR. HUNTER: It is. And we put that
7 by-law in, that's got to be eight years ago. And
8 council has really stayed on board because of that
9 by-law. That's one of the big questions we have
10 in our R.M., are we keeping our municipality
11 green? Like I say, we've got a lot of drainage in
12 our area. And water quality is another issue
13 that's coming into effect. I think you all know
14 that. And all of this comes into play.

15 MR. MOTHERAL: Obviously, if there was
16 dissatisfaction, you still wouldn't be on council,
17 I guess, is what you are saying?

18 MR. HUNTER: I can't answer that one.

19 THE CHAIRMAN: Thank you very much,
20 Mr. Hunter.

21 MR. HUNTER: Thank you for your time.

22 THE CHAIRMAN: Thanks for coming out.
23 Now, does anybody else wish to make a presentation
24 this evening? Well, we will wait a few more
25 minutes and see if anyone wishes to make a

1 presentation. Otherwise, we will adjourn, but we
2 will wait a few minutes. So we will take a break.
3 I think that there is still some coffee and
4 cookies at the back, if anybody would like to help
5 themselves?

6 (PROCEEDINGS ADJOURNED AT 7:30 P.M.)

7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

CERTIFICATE

I, LISA REID, Court Reporter in the Province of
Manitoba, do hereby certify the foregoing pages
are a true and correct transcript of my Stenotype
notes as taken by me at the time and place
hereinbefore stated.

Lisa Reid